	Casase23:20-07-858-54MP:00.000emtent Filefiled/06/29/20agedeo1.0717		
1	D (- W-1 L :-: CDN 124290		
1	Renée Welze Livingston – SBN 124280 LIVINGSTON LAW FIRM		
2	A Professional Corporation 1600 South Main Street, Suite 280		
3	Walnut Creek, CA 94596 Tel: (925) 952-9880		
4	Fax: (925) 952-9881		
5	Email: rlivingston@livingstonlawyers.com		
6	Attorneys for Defendant TARGET CORPORATION		
7	INITED STATES DISTRICT COLDT		
8	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
9	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CHERYL CHARLES, Case No.		
	Plaintiff,	PETITION FOR REMOVAL OF ACTION	
11	V.	PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b)	
12	TARGET CORPORATION,	DIVERSITY]	
13	and DOES 1 to 50, Inclusive,	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL	
14	Defendants.	[San Mateo County Superior Court Case No 20-CIV-00723]	
15)	
16	TO THE CLERK OF THE ABOVE-CAPTION	ED COLIDT:	
17			
18	PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that defendant	· ·	
19	"TARGET") hereby removes to this Court the st		
20		ICTION	
21	1. Defendant TARGET is informed and believes that plaintiff CHERYL CHARLES		
22	is a citizen of the State of California and was at the time of the filing of the Complaint and this		
23	Petition for Removal.		
24	2. Defendant TARGET is a Minnesota corporation whose principal place of business		
25	is Minneapolis, Minnesota.		
26	3. TARGET is a publicly held corporation whose chairman and chief executive		
27	officer is Brian C. Cornell.		
28	Charles v. Target Corporation, Case No. PETITION FOR REMOVAL OF ACTION PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b) [DIVERSITY]; DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL		

- 4. Defendant TARGET is not a citizen of the state in which this action is pending.
- 5. The matter in controversy exceeds the sum of \$75,000.00, exclusive of interest, attorneys' fees and costs.
 - 6. This court has jurisdiction by virtue of 28 U.S.C. §1332 and 28 U.S.C. §1441(b).

GROUNDS FOR REMOVAL

- 7. On January 31, 2020, plaintiff CHERYL CHARLES commenced a civil action in San Mateo County Superior Court, Unlimited Jurisdiction, in the State of California, entitled *Cheryl Charles v. Target Corporation*, Case No. 20-CIV-00273. True and correct copies of the Summons and Complaint are attached hereto and marked as **Exhibit A**. Defendant TARGET was served with the Summons and Complaint on October 12, 2020. In said action, plaintiff seeks personal injury damages based on a theory of premises liability for an incident that occurred on February 2, 2018, at TARGET's premises when plaintiff CHERYL CHARLES tripped, slipped, stumbled, and/or fell on the floor of the Target retail sales location at 5001 Junipero Serra Boulevard, Colma, California, suffering a fracture of her right pelvis requiring extensive medical care.
- 8. Defendant TARGET filed an Answer to plaintiff's unverified Complaint on November 6, 2020. A true and correct copy of the Answer is attached hereto and marked as **Exhibit B.**
- 9. Before the Complaint was filed, plaintiff supplied information about her injuries and damages to TARGET and demanded in settlement the amount of defendant TARGET's policy limit based on medical diagnoses of right pelvic fracture involving superior pubic ramus and pubic symphysis, exacerbation of her pre-existing multiple sclerosis and major depression requiring admission to the hospital at Seton Medical Center in Daly City, CA from February 3, 2018 to February 13, 2018. Plaintiff submitted to TARGET documentation of medical expenses for treatment at Seton Medical Center in the amount of \$126,152.00. In addition, plaintiff received additional medical treatment after discharge from the hospital and seeks, according to the Complaint, compensatory damages including wage loss, loss of earning capacity, general

Case 4e28:20-07-8578-54MPDo DorocenteInt Filefold. (1/106/1/29/20Page 3e08 1) 17

damage and other unspecified damages. 1 2 10. This Court has original jurisdiction of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1332, 3 and the Complaint is one which may be removed to this Court by defendant TARGET pursuant 4 to the provisions of 28 U.S.C. §1441(b) in that it is a civil action between citizens of different 5 states, and the amount in controversy exceeds the sum of \$75,000, exclusive of interest and 6 costs. 7 Based on the foregoing, defendant TARGET respectfully requests that this Court accept removal of this action. 8 9 Dated: November 6, 2020 LIVINGSTON LAW FIRM 10 11 12 Renée Welze Livingson 13 Attorneys for Defendant TARGET CORPORATION 14 15 16 **DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL** 17 Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 38(b), defendant TARGET CORPORATION hereby demands 18 a jury in the above entitled action. 19 Dated: November 6, 2020 LIVINGSTON LAW FIRM 20 21 22 Renée Welze //ivingston 23 Attorneys for Defendant TARGET CORPORATION 24 25 26 27 28

Charles v. Target Corporation, Case No.

PETITION FOR REMOVAL OF ACTION PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b) [DIVERSITY]; DEMAND FOR

EXHIBIT A

SUMMONS (CITACION JUDICIAL)

NOTICE TO DEFENDANT: (AVISO AL DEMANDADO):

Target Corporation; and DOES 1 to 50, Inclusive.

YOU ARE BEING SUED BY PLAINTIFF: (LO ESTÁ DEMANDANDO EL DEMANDANTE):

Cheryl Charles

FOR COURT USE ONLY (SOLO PARA USO DE LA CORTE)

Electronically
FILED

by Superior Court of California, County of San Mateo
ON 1/31/2020

By /s/ Anthony Berini
Deputy Clerk

NOTICE! You have been sued. The court may decide against you without your being heard unless you respond within 30 days. Read the information below.

You have 30 CALENDAR DAYS after this summons and legal papers are served on you to file a written response at this court and have a copy served on the plaintiff. A letter or phone call will not protect you. Your written response must be in proper legal form if you want the court to hear your case. There may be a court form that you can use for your response. You can find these court forms and more information at the California Courts Online Self-Help Center (www.courtinfo.ca.gov/selfhelp), your county law library, or the courthouse nearest you. If you cannot pay the filing fee, ask the court clerk for a fee waiver form. If you do not file your response on time, you may lose the case by default, and your wages, money, and property may be taken without further warning from the court.

There are other legal requirements. You may want to call an attorney right away. If you do not know an attorney, you may want to call an attorney referral service. If you cannot afford an attorney, you may be eligible for free legal services from a nonprofit legal services program. You can locate these nonprofit groups at the California Legal Services Web site (www.lawhelpcalifornia.org), the California Courts Online Self-Help Center (www.courtinfo.ca.gov/selfhelp), or by contacting your local court or county bar association. NOTE: The court has a statutory lien for waived fees and costs on any settlement or arbitration award of \$10,000 or more in a civil case. The court's lien must be paid before the court will dismiss the case. ¡AVISO! Lo han demandado. Si no responde dentro de 30 dias, la corte puede decidir en su contra sin escuchar su versión. Lea la información a continuación.

Tiene 30 DÍAS DE CALENDARIO después de que le entreguen esta citación y papeles legales para presentar una respuesta por escrito en esta corte y hacer que se entregue una copia al demandante. Una carta o una llamada telefónica no lo protegen. Su respuesta por escrito tiene que estar en formato legal correcto si desea que procesen su caso en la corte. Es posible que haya un formulario que usted pueda usar para su respuesta. Puede encontrar estos formularios de la corte y más información en el Centro de Ayuda de las Cortes de California (www.sucorte.ca.gov), en la biblioteca de leyes de su condado o en la corte que le quede más cerca. Si no puede pagar la cuota de presentación, pida al secretario de la corte que le dé un formulario de exención de pago de cuotas. Si no presenta su respuesta a tiempo, puede perder el caso por incumplimiento y la corte le podrà quitar su sueldo, dinero y bienes sin más advertencia.

Hay otros requisitos legales. Es recomendable que llame a un abogado inmediatamente. Si no conoce a un abogado, puede llamar a un servicio de remisión a abogados. Si no puede pagar a un abogado, es posible que cumpla con los requisitos para obtener servicios legales gratuitos de un programa de servicios legales sin fines de lucro. Puede encontrar estos grupos sin fines de lucro en el sitio web de California Legal Services, (www.lawhelpcalifornia.org), en el Centro de Ayuda de las Cortes de California, (www.sucorte.ca.gov) o poniéndose en contacto con la corte o el colegio de abogados locales. AVISO: Por ley, la corte tiene derecho a reclamar las cuotas y los costos exentos por imponer un gravamen sobre cualquier recuperación de \$10,000 ó más de valor recibida mediante un acuerdo o una concesión de arbitraje en un caso de derecho civil. Tiene que pagar el gravamen de la corte antes de que la corte pueda desechar el caso.

The name and address of the court is:

(El nombre y dirección de la corte es):

Southern Branch - Hall of Justice - San Mateo Superior Court

400 County Center Redwood City, CA 94063

CASE NUMBER: (Número del Caso): 20-CIV-00723

The name, address, and telephone number of plaintiff's attorney, or plaintiff without an attorney, is: (El nombre, la dirección y el número de teléfono del abogado del demandante, o del demandante que no tiene abogado, es):

Arin Khodaverdian | 234 E. Colorado Blvd., Suite 720 | Pasadena, CA 91101 | 626-460-8240

(Fecha) 1/31/2020

Neal I. Taniguchi

Clerk, by (Secretario)

/s/ Anthony Berini

, Deputy (Adjunto)

(For proof of service of this summons, use Proof of Service of Summons (form POS-010).)

(SEAL)	NOTICE TO THE PERSON SERVED: You are served	
	1. as an individual defendant.	
COULT	2. as the person sued under the fictitious name of (specify):	
	3. In on behalf of (specify): Target Corporation	
	Under: CCP 416.10 (corporation)	
	CCP 416.20 (defunct corporation) CCP 416.70 (conservatee)	
The state of the s	CCP 416.40 (association or partnership) CCP 416.90 (authorized personal content of the content o	on)
	other (specify):	
	→ 4.	ge 1 o

Form Adopted for Mandatory Uşe Judicial Council of California SUM-100 [Rev. July 1, 2009] SUMMONS

Code of Civil Procedure §§ 412.20, 465

PLD-PI-001

	Y
ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY (Name, State Bar number, and address): Arin Khodaverdian SBN 271971	FOR COURT USE ONLY
234 E. Colorado Blvd., Suite 720	Electronically
Pasadena, CA 91101	FILED
(by Superior Court of California, County of San Mateo
TELEPHONE NO: 626-460-8240 FAX NO. (Optional):	ON 1/31/2020
E-MAIL ADDRESS (Optional):	By/s/ Anthony Berini
ATTORNEY FOR (Name): Plaintiff, Cheryl Charles	Deputy Člerk
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF SAN MATEO	
STREET ADDRESS: 400 County Center	
MAILING ADDRESS: 400 County Center	
CITY AND ZIP CODE: Redwood City, CA 94063	
BRANCH NAME: Southern Branch - Hall of Justice	
PLAINTIFF: Cheryl Charles	
DEFENDANT: Target Corporation, and	
DOES 1 TO 50, Inclusive.	•
COMPLAINT—Personal Injury, Property Damage, Wrongful Death	
AMENDED (Number):	
Type (check all that apply):	
MOTOR VEHICLE OTHER (specify): Premises Liability	
Property Damage Wrongful Death	
Personal Injury Other Damages (specify):	
Jurisdiction (check all that apply):	CASE NUMBER;
ACTION IS A LIMITED CIVIL CASE	20-CIV-00723
Amount demanded does not exceed \$10,000 exceed \$10,000, but does not exceed \$25,000	20-017-00723
ACTION IS AN UNLIMITED CIVIL CASE (exceeds \$25,000)	
ACTION IS RECLASSIFIED by this amended complaint	
from limited to unlimited	
from unlimited to limited	•
1. Plaintiff (name or names): Cheryl Charles	
alleges causes of action against defendant (name or names):	
Target Corporation; and DOES 1 to 50, Inclusive	
2. This pleading, including attachments and exhibits, consists of the following number of pa	des: Five (5).
Each plaintiff named above is a competent adult	g
a. except plaintiff (name):	
(1) a corporation qualified to do business in California	
(2) an unincorporated entity (describe):	
(3) a public entity (describe):	
(4) a minor an adult	
(a) for whom a guardian or conservator of the estate or a guard	dian ad litem has been appointed
(b) other (specify):	
(5) other (specify):	
b. except plaintiff (name):	
(1) a corporation qualified to do business in California	
(2) an unincorporated entity (describe):	
(3) a public entity (describe):	
(4) a minor an adult:	dian ad Itam has been sonsisted
(a) for whom a guardian or conservator of the estate or conservator or co	olan au litem has been appointed
(5) other (specify):	
Information about additional plaintiffs who are not competent adults is shown in Atta	achment 3
The manufacture and a supplier of the supplier	Page 1 of :

PLD-PI-001

SHORT TITLE:	CASE'NUMBER:
Charles v. Target Corporation, et al.	20-CIV-00723
Citaties v. Larger Corporation, et al.	20.017-00120
4. Plaintiff (name):	
is doing business under the fictitious name (specify):	
and has complied with the fictitious business name laws.	
5. Each defendant named above is a natural person	
a. except defendant (name): Target Corporation c. except defen	, =
	usiness organization, form unknown
	orporation unincorporated entity (describe):
(o) [] and composition entiry (describe).	unincorporated entity (describe).
(4) a public entity (describe):	ublic entity (describe):
(4) a public criticy (position).	done critity (describe).
(5) other (specify): (5) oth	er (specify):
	(2)
b. except defendant (name): d. except defendant	idant (name):
	usiness organization, form unknown
·	orporation
(3) an unincorporated entity (describe): (3) an	unincorporated entity (describe):
(4) a public entity (describe): (4) a p	public entity (describe):
(5) other (specify): (5) oth	or (andalfu).
(5) other (specify): (5) oth	er (specify):
Information about additional defendants who are not natural persons is contained	Lin Attachment 5.
6. The true names of defendants sued as Does are unknown to plaintiff.	
4.05	re the agents or employees of other
named defendants and acted within the scope of that agency or employmen	t.
	persons whose capacities are unknown to
plaintiff.	persons whose capacities are difficient to
7. Defendants who are joined under Code of Civil Procedure section 382 are (nam	es):
8. This court is the proper court because	
a. at least one defendant now resides in its jurisdictional area.	
b the principal place of business of a defendant corporation or unincorporated	association is in its jurisdictional area.
c. injury to person or damage to personal property occurred in its jurisdictional	area.
d other (specify):	
9. Plaintiff is required to comply with a claims statute, and	•
a has complied with applicable claims statutes, or	
b. is excused from complying because (specify):	•
	•

		PLD	-PI-001
SHORT TITLE: Charles v. Target Corporation, et al.	CASE NUMBER: 20-CIV-00723		•
10. The following causes of action are attached and the statements above apply to each (excauses of action attached):	ach complaint must have o	ne or m	nore
a. Motor Vehicle b. General Negligence c. Intentional Tort d. Products Liability	•		
e. Premises Liability f. Other (specify):			
11. Plaintiff has suffered a. wage loss b. loss of use of property			
c. hospital and medical expenses d. general damage e. property damage			
f. Ioss of earning capacity g. other damage (specify): Other damages to be determined up through discovery and up through the time	ne of trial.		
		:	
12. The damages claimed for wrongful death and the relationships of plaintiff to the dia. Issted in Attachment 12.b. as follows:	eceased are		
13. The relief sought in this complaint is within the jurisdiction of this court.	•		
14. Plaintiff prays for judgment for costs of suit; for such relief as is fair, just, and equitable a. (1) compensatory damages	; and for		
 (2) punitive damages The amount of damages is (in cases for personal injury or wrongful death, you must (1) according to proof (2) in the amount of \$ 	t check (1)):		
15. The paragraphs of this complaint alleged on information and belief are as follows	(specify paragraph number	s).	
Date: JANUARY 30, 2020			
ARIN KHODAVERDIAN (TYPE OR PRINT NAME)		!	

			PLD-PI-001(4)
SHORT TITLE:		CASE NUMBER:	
Charles v. Target Corporation, et a	il.	20-CIV-00723	
	CAUSE OF ACTION—PI	remises Liability	Page1
(númper)			:
ATTACHMENT TO (Use a separate cause of action f	mplaint Cross - Complaint		
Prem.L-1. Plaintiff (name): Cher	yr Charles efendants were the legal (proximate) c	ause of damages to plaintiff	
On (date): February		vas injured on the following premise	s in the following
fashion (description of	of premises and circumstances of injur	ý):	
	ed and fall at Defendant's premises at ined premises with dangerous condition		
	•		
	 Negligence The defendants who neglection of the control of the contr	gligently owned, maintained, manag	ged and
Target Corpo	oration, and		
Does.	1 to 10		•
	-Willful Failure to Warn [Civil Code s ly failed to guard or warn against a dar		
Target Corpo	oration; and		
✓ Does	11 to 20		
		d guest a paying guest.	•
Prem.L-4. Count Thre	e—Dangerous Condition of Public Flangerous condition existed were (name	Property The defendants who owner	d public property
A STATE OF THE STA	engerous condition existed were man	103j.	
Ť		. •	
]Does to		
dai	e defendant public entity had ac orgerous condition in sufficient time price or condition was created by employees	or to the injury to have corrected it.	the existence of the
Prem.L-5. a. Allegations	about Other Defendants The defendants and acted within the scope of the	dants who were the agents and emp	loyees of the
Target Corp			
✓ Does	21 to 30		4 :
	ants who are liable to plaintiffs for other bed in attachment Prem.L-5.b		liability are
Does 31-50			

EXHIBIT B

1	Case: 9225-20-00-858544VIRJOCTOGEMENT FILEGIO	Electronically	
		FILED by Superior Court of California, County of San Mateo	
		ON 11/5/2020	
1	Renée Welze Livingston – SBN 124280	By <u>/s/ Mia Marlowe</u> Deputy Clerk	
2	LIVINGSTON LAW FIRM A Professional Corporation		
3	1600 South Main Street, Suite 280 Walnut Creek, CA 94596		
4	Tel: (925) 952-9880 Fax: (925) 952-9881	•	
5	Email: rlivingston@livingstonlawyers.com		
6	Attorneys for Defendant TARGET CORPORATION		
7			
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA		
9	COUNTY OF SAN MAT	EO - UNLIMITED CIVIL	
10	CHERYL CHARLES,	Case No. 20-CIV-00723	
11	Plaintiff,	ANSWER OF DEFENDANT TARGET CORPORATION	
12	v.) Complaint Filed: 01/31/2020	
13	TARGET CORPORATION, and DOES 1 to 50, Inclusive,	Trial Date: None	
14	Defendants.		
15	Detendants.))	
16	COMES NOW defendant TARGET COR	RPORATION and answers the Complaint of	
17	plaintiff CHERYL CHARLES as follows:		
18	GENERA	L DENIAL	
19	Under the provisions of Code of Civil Pro	ocedure section 431.30, defendant denies	
20	generally and specifically, conjunctively and disjunctively, each and every allegation contained		
21	in the Complaint and further denies that plaintiff has sustained damages in any sum or sums		
22	alleged, or any other sum or at all, as a result of any act or omission by or on behalf of this		
23	answering defendant.		
24	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES		
25	1. AS A FIRST, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, this answering		
26	defendant alleges plaintiff fails to state a cause of action upon which relief can be granted agains		
27	this answering defendant.		
28	2. AS A SECOND, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, this		
	Charles v. Target Corporation, Case No. 20-CIV-00723 ANSWER OF DEFENDANT TARGET CORPORATION -	N 1-	

answering defendant alleges plaintiff was concurrently and comparatively negligent and/or careless in and about the matters referred to in said Complaint on file herein, and that said carelessness and negligence on plaintiff's own part proximately and directly contributed to and caused the injuries, loss and damages complained of by plaintiff, if any there were.

- 3. **AS A THIRD, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**, this answering defendant alleges the injuries and damages complained of by plaintiff, if any, were either wholly or in part proximately caused by the negligence or other wrongful acts or omissions of persons or entities other than this answering defendant, and that said negligence and/or wrongful acts or omissions either are imputed to plaintiff by reason of her relationship with said persons or entities, or comparatively reduce the proportion of negligence and corresponding liability of this answering defendant, if any, which liability is specifically denied.
- **AS A FOURTH, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**, this answering defendant alleges that each of the causes of action asserted in plaintiff's Complaint is barred by the statute of limitations set forth in Code of Civil Procedure section 335.1.
- 5. **AS A FIFTH, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**, this answering defendant alleges plaintiff failed to exercise reasonable care and diligence to avoid loss and to minimize and mitigate her damages, if any there were, and this failure to mitigate damages alone aggravated any injuries or damages to plaintiff, if any, and therefore precludes or reduces recovery against this answering defendant.
- 6. **AS A SIXTH, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE,** this answering defendant alleges that if liability is assessed against it, pursuant to Civil Code section 1431 *et seq.*, defendant shall be liable only for the amount of non-economic damages allocated to it in direct proportion to the percentage of fault assessed against it by the trier of fact and requests a separate judgment be rendered against it for that amount; but defendant in setting forth this affirmative defense makes no admission it is liable to plaintiff in any amount or in any proportion; and defendant, in setting forth this affirmative defense, makes no admission plaintiff has been damaged in any sum or sums at all.
 - 7. AS A SEVENTH, SEPARATE AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, this

28

1 PROOF OF SERVICE 2 I, the undersigned, hereby declare that I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within action. My business address is 1600 South Main Street, Suite 280, Walnut 3 Creek, California 94596. On the date set forth below, I served the following: 4 ANSWER OF DEFENDANT TARGET CORPORATION 5 upon the following at the addresses stated below: 6 Arin Khodaverdian, Esq. 7 ALPINE LAW GROUP, A.P.C. A Professional Law Corporation 8 17500 Red Hill Ave., Suite 100 9 Irvine, CA 92614 Tel: (800 891-5458 10 Fax: (800) 891-5458 Email: arin@alpinelawgroup.com 11 Siamak Vaziri, Esq. 12 Matthew M. Taylor, Esq. 13 Aaron Miller, Esq. Andrew Alexandroff, Esq. 14 VAZIRI LAW GROUP, A.P.C. 5757 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 670 15 Los Angeles, CA 90036-3692 Tel: (310) 777-7540 16 Fax: (310) 777-0373 17 Email: mtteam@vazirilaw.com svaziri@vazirilaw.com 18 Attorneys for Plaintiff Cheryl Charles 19 20 Service was accomplished as follows: 21 BY US MAIL, According to Normal Business Practices. At my place of business at the above address, I sealed the above document(s) in an envelope addressed to the 22 above, and I placed that sealed envelope for collection and mailing following ordinary 23 business practices, for deposit with the U.S. Postal Service. I am readily familiar with the business practice at my place of business for the collection and processing of 24 correspondence for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service. Correspondence so collected and processed is deposited with the U.S. Postal Service the same day in the ordinary 25 course of business, postage fully prepaid. 26 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the 27 foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on November 5, 2020, at 28 Charles v. Target Corporation; Case No. 20-CIV-00723

Proof of Service

Walnut Creek, California.

Charles v. Target Corporation; Case No. 20-CIV-00723 Proof of Service

1 PROOF OF SERVICE 2 I, the undersigned, hereby certify that I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within action. My business address is 1600 South Main Street, Suite 280, Walnut 3 Creek, California 94596. On the date set forth below, I served the following: 4 PETITION FOR REMOVAL OF ACTION PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b) 5 [DIVERSITY]; DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL and 6 **CIVIL COVER SHEET** 7 upon the following at the addresses stated below: 8 Arin Khodaverdian, Esq. 9 ALPINE LAW GROUP, A.P.C. 17500 Red Hill Ave., Suite 100 10 Irvine, CA 92614 Tel: (800 891-5458 11 Fax: (800) 891-5458 Email: arin@alpinelawgroup.com 12 13 Siamak Vaziri, Esq. Matthew M. Taylor, Esq. 14 Aaron Miller, Esq. Andrew Alexandroff, Esq. 15 VAZIRI LAW GROUP, A.P.C. 16 5757 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 670 Los Angeles, CA 90036-3692 17 Tel: (310) 777-7540 Fax: (310) 777-0373 18 Email: mtteam@vazirilaw.com svaziri@vazirilaw.com 19 20 Attorneys for Plaintiff Cheryl Charles 21 Service was accomplished as follows: 22 BY US MAIL, According to Normal Business Practices. At my place of business at 23 the above address, I sealed the above document(s) in an envelope addressed to the above, and I placed that sealed envelope for collection and mailing following ordinary 24 business practices, for deposit with the U.S. Postal Service. I am readily familiar with the business practice at my place of business for the collection and processing of 25 correspondence for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service. Correspondence so collected and processed is deposited with the U.S. Postal Service the same day in the ordinary 26 course of business, postage fully prepaid. 27 28 Charles v. Target Corporation; Case No. 20-CIV-00723

Proof of Service

Cases 428:20-07-85-854MPDo Clorocente ht File file (1/06/29/20) a grade of of of 17

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct, and that this declaration was executed on November 6, 2020, at Walnut Creek, California. Suzi Bacha

Charles v. Target Corporation; Case No. 20-CIV-00723
Proof of Service